

Concise Minutes – Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee

Meeting Venue:

Committee Room 2 – Senedd

Meeting date: Thursday, 26 November 2015

Meeting time: Times Not Specified

This meeting can be viewed

on [Senedd TV](#) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/3304>

Attendance

Category	Names
Assembly Members:	Christine Chapman AM (Chair) Peter Black AM Alun Davies AM Suzy Davies AM (In place of Janet Finch–Saunders AM) Mike Hedges AM Mark Isherwood AM Bethan Jenkins AM Gwyn R Price AM John Griffiths AM (In place of Gwenda Thomas AM)
Witnesses:	Ken Skates AM, The Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism Eifiona Williams, Welsh Government Angharad Huws, Welsh Government Lord Hall, BBC Executive



Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales

	Rhodri Talfan Davies, Director, BBC Cymru Wales
Committee Staff:	Sarah Beasley (Clerk) Claire Morris (Second Clerk) Chloe Davies (Deputy Clerk) Sarah Sargent (Deputy Clerk) Robin Wilkinson (Researcher) Joanest Varney-Jackson

Transcript

1 Introductions, apologies, substitutions and declarations

- 1.1. The Chair welcomed Members and members of the public to the meeting.
- 1.2. Apologies for absence were received from Gwenda Thomas AM, Janet Finch Saunders AM and Lindsay Whittle AM. John Griffiths AM, Suzy Davies AM and Rhodri Glyn Thomas AM substituted for them in accordance with Standing Order 17.48.
- 1.3. The following Members declared relevant interests under Standing Order 17.24A:
 - Ken Skates AM, Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism
 - Peter Black AM
 - Rhodri Glyn Thomas AM
 - Mike Hedges AM

2 Historic Environment (Wales) Bill – consideration of amendments

2.1 In accordance with Standing Order 26.21, the Committee disposed of the following amendments to the Bill:

Amendment 1 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendments 2, 3 and 4 (Ken Skates) were disposed of en bloc and were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

Amendment 49 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Peter Black	Christine Chapman	
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies	
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges	
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths	
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 49 was not agreed.		

Amendment 50 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 51 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths

Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 64 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 65 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 66 (Suzy Davies) was not moved.

Amendment 79 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman

Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 5 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 6 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 7 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 40 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 8 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

As **amendment 8** was agreed, **amendment 41 (Peter Black)** fell.

Amendment 28 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 9 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 8 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 10 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 52 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 71 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 40 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
------------------	----------------

Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 80 (Bethan Jenkins) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 70 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 11 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 12 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 53 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman

Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 81 (Bethan Jenkins) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 82 (Bethan Jenkins) was not moved.

Amendments 67, 68 and 69 (Suzy Davies) were disposed of en bloc

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 13 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 14 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 83 (Bethan Jenkins) was not moved.

Amendment 15 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 84 (Bethan Jenkins) was not moved.

Amendments 16, 17 and 18 (Ken Skates) were disposed of en bloc and were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 54 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.)	

Amendment 73 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.)	

Amendment 74 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
------------------	----------------

Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 19 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 45 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 20 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

As **amendment 20** was agreed, **amendment 46 (Peter Black)** fell.

Amendment 29 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 55 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
-----------	---------

Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 85 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendments 21, 22 and 23 (Ken Skates) were disposed of en bloc and were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 56 (Suzy Davies) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 57 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges

Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 75 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 76 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 86 (Bethan Jenkins) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 77 (Peter Black) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 78 (Peter Black) was not moved.

Amendment 98 (Darren Millar)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.)	

Amendment 42 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.)	

Amendment 72 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges

Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 30 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 31 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 87 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

As **amendment 87** was not agreed, **amendment 88 (Bethan Jenkins)** fell.

Amendments 33, 34, 35, 36, 37 and 38 (Ken Skates) were disposed of en bloc and were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 89 (Bethan Jenkins) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 90 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
-----------	---------

Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 24 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 92 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 90 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	Christine Chapman
Suzy Davies	Alun Davies
Mark Isherwood	Mike Hedges
Bethan Jenkins	John Griffiths
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 91 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
	Peter Black
Amendment 91 was not agreed.	

Amendment 58 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 47 (Peter Black) was not moved.

Amendment 59 (Suzy Davies) was not moved.

Amendment 93 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
	Peter Black
Amendment 93 was not agreed.	

Amendment 94 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.)	

Amendment 95 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths

	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 97 (Bethan Jenkins)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 60 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 26 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 61 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

As amendments 86, 93 and 95 were not agreed, amendment 96 (Bethan Jenkins) fell.

Amendment 62 (Suzy Davies) was not moved.

Amendment 48 (Peter Black)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.	

Amendment 39 (Ken Skates) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 63 (Suzy Davies)

In favour	Against
Peter Black	
Suzy Davies	Christine Chapman
Mark Isherwood	Alun Davies
Bethan Jenkins	Mike Hedges
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	John Griffiths
	Gwyn Price
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6).	

3 Inquiry into the BBC Charter Review: evidence session 7 – BBC

3.1 The Committee received evidence from:

- Lord Hall of Birkenhead CBE, Director-General, BBC
- Rhodri Talfan Davies, Director, BBC Cymru Wales

3.2 Rhodri Talfan Davies agreed to provide the Committee with details of BBC Cymru Wales's tracking surveys which monitor overall media consumption in Wales.

4 Papers to note

4.1. The Committee noted the papers.

5 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting

5.1 The Committee agreed the motion.

6 Inquiry into the BBC Charter Review – discussion of evidence received in session 7

6.1 The Committee discussed the evidence received in item 3.